

City of Newton, Massachusetts

Department of Planning and Development 1000 Commonwealth Avenue Newton, Massachusetts 02459

Telephone (617) 796-1120 Telefax (617) 796-1142 TDD/TTY (617) 796-1089 www.newtonma.gov

James Freas Acting Director

MINUTES OF PUBLIC MEETING AND PUBLIC HEARINGS NEWTON UPPER FALLS HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

DATE: November 13, 2014

PLACE/TIME: City Hall, Room 202

7:30 p.m.

ATTENDING: Paul Snyder, Acting Chair

> Laurie Malcom, Member Jeff Riklin, Member Jay Walter, Member

Barbara Kurze, Commission Staff

See Attendance List

ABSENT: Larry Schwirian, Chairman

> Don Lang, Member Beth Corr, Alternate Jon Sales, Alternate

The meeting was called to order at 7:30 pm with Paul Snyder serving as Chair. Voting permanent members were L. Malcom, J. Riklin, and J. Walter. B. Kurze, Senior Preservation Planner, acted as recording secretary and the meeting was digitally recorded on an H2 Zoom recording device.

967 Chestnut Street - Certificate of Appropriateness

Owner Vincent Cho and Michael Bogart presented an application to enclose the entryway with windows. The entry is located at the rear of the property and the enclosure would be a traditional design made of fir with single pane glass and would be similar to the entry enclosure at 966 Chestnut Street.

Materials Reviewed:

Assessor's map **Photographs** Drawing MHC Form B

J. Riklin commented that the entry was visible from the public way. J. Walter noted that the columns should be enclosed and trimmed out. M. Bogart stated that the concrete stairs would remain. J. Walter motioned to accept the proposal to enclose the entryway with the following requirements: 1) the corner trimmed columns would be trimmed out so the enclosure was built against flat stock; and 2) the enclosed front entry porch at 966 Chestnut Street would be used as the model. L. Malcom seconded the motion. This motion was passed unanimously.

RECORD OF ACTION:

DATE: November 13, 2014

SUBJECT: 967 Chestnut Street - Certificate of Appropriateness

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on November 13, 2014 the Newton Upper Falls Historic District Commission, by vote of 4-0:

RESOLVED to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the application as submitted at <u>967 Chestnut Street</u> to enclose the entryway with the following requirements: 1) the corner trimmed columns will be trimmed out so the enclosure is built against flat stock; and 2) the enclosed front entry porch at 966 Chestnut Street will be used as the model.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Paul Snyder, Acting Chair Jay Walter, Member

Laurie Malcom, Member Jeff Riklin, Member

1009 Chestnut Street – Certificate of Appropriateness

B. Kurze noted that the applicant was appearing before the Commission again because an abutter had responded to the Waiver of Public Hearing notice and had contested the decision to approve the sign. Business manager Lynette Gittens presented the application to install an awning sign. The 20-inch by 48-inch by 12-inch steel awning frame would be mounted to the brick façade above the business entry door with Z clips and metal fasteners. The awning material would be forest green Sunbrella and the graphics would be white exterior grade sign paint. L. Gittens noted that City Zoning Ordinances required smaller lettering than what had been presented in the October meeting. She also stated that this was the only entrance to the business.

Materials Reviewed:

Assessor's map **Photographs** Sign plan Sign specifications MHC Form B

- J. Riklin expressed concern that the sign was standing off the building and presented as a modern sign. P. Snyder and J. Walter commented that awnings were common on historic commercial buildings. B. Kurze provided Commission members with a letter from abutters Frank R. Gazarian and Karen Lento Gazarian stating their opposition to the sign. The letter was entered in the record. J. Walter motioned to accept the sign as proposed with the smaller lettering. L. Malcom seconded the motion. This motion failed as the vote was 3-1.
- J. Riklin stated that a sign that was flush with the building would be appropriate. L. Gittens explained that the awning would be more attractive and appropriate for a salon; she also noted that the sign was in the rear of



the building and not in a prominent location. Commission members noted that other signs on the building stuck out even more and that awnings were common on historic commercial buildings. J. Walter motioned to accept the application as submitted with the required smaller lettering. L. Malcom seconded the motion. This motion was passed unanimously.

RECORD OF ACTION:

DATE: November 13, 2014

SUBJECT: 1009 Chestnut Street - Certificate of Appropriateness

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on November 13, 2014 the Newton Upper Falls Historic District Commission, by vote of 4-0:

RESOLVED to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the application as submitted at <u>1009 Chestnut Street</u> to install a sign with the smaller lettering required by the City of Newton Zoning Ordinance.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Paul Snyder, Acting Chair Jay Walter, Member Laurie Malcom, Member

Jeff Riklin, Member

16 Sullivan Avenue - Certificate of Appropriateness

Owner Peter Shin and Darren Locek of RI Home Improvement presented an application to install replace all of the windows except two basement windows. D. Locek showed a sample of the proposed paintable composite window with wood on the inside; he explained that the siding would have to be cut back but that the unit would fit into the existing window openings. The model shown did not have a spacer bar but those could be ordered. The owners were concerned with preserving the ornate interior trim.

Materials Reviewed:

Assessor's map
Photographs
Product specifications
MHC Form B

- J. Riklin stated that the Commission had approved clad windows but had not approved composite. Commission members commented that the proposed windows did not present as wood and did not look historical; the soft profile around the perimeter was especially problematic. Commission members noted that the windows would very visible as the house was right on the street. L. Malcom stated that the Commission did not want to set a precedent for an inappropriate window. J. Walter noted that wood clad windows (wood interior, covered aluminum exterior) with SDLs would be appropriate. The Commission had previously approved Anderson Renewals, Pella, Marvin and Harvey aluminum clad.
- J. Walter motioned to accept the application to replace the windows with the requirement that a different replacement window would be submitted for Staff approval and that the window would be double-hung with SDLs and space bars, would maintain the historic sills and would be consistent with the existing windows. L. Malcom seconded the motion. This motion was passed unanimously.

RECORD OF ACTION:

DATE: November 13, 2014

SUBJECT: 16 Sullivan Avenue - Certificate of Appropriateness

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on November 13, 2014 the Newton Upper Falls Historic District Commission, by vote of 4-0:

RESOLVED to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the application as submitted at <u>16 Sullivan Avenue</u> to replace the existing windows with the requirements that: 1) a different replacement window be submitted for Staff approval; and 2) that the replacement windows would be clad, double-hung windows with SDLs and spacer bars, would maintain the historic sills and would match the existing window configurations.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Paul Snyder, Acting Chair Jay Walter, Member

Laurie Malcom, Member

Jeff Riklin, Member

1009 Chestnut Street - Certificate of Appropriateness

Joseph Kavaletzik presented an application to replace a wood door with a fiberglass rear door ex post facto.

<u>Materials Reviewed:</u>

Assessor's map Photograph

- J. Riklin noted that the door was installed without a permit. The replacement door was fiberglass while the adjacent doors were wood. B. Kurze stated that she had contact Lev Agramovich prior to the meeting to let him know that a wood door that matched the adjacent doors was required and that thermal panes would be acceptable. B. Kurze provided Commission members with a letter from abutters Frank R. Gazarian and Karen Lento Gazarian stating their opposition to the fiberglass door and requesting that the Commission require a wood door. The letter was entered in the record. Commission members stated that all proposed changes to the exterior of the property had to come to the Commission for review.
- J. Riklin motioned to deny the door which was installed without approval and that the door be changed back to what was there before. J. Walter seconded the motion. This motion was passed unanimously.

Commission members reiterated that the fiberglass door was installed without approval and needed to be changed. The applicants should work with Staff and Inspectional Services to resolve the issue. Commission members requested Staff to advise Inspectional Services that the fiberglass door was in violation and to monitor the situation.

RECORD OF ACTION:

DATE: November 13, 2014

SUBJECT: 1009 Chestnut Street - Certificate of Appropriateness

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on November 13, 2014 the Newton Upper Falls Historic District Commission, by vote of 4-0:



RESOLVED to **deny** a Certificate of Appropriateness for the application as submitted at <u>1009 Chestnut Street</u> for the fiberglass door installed without approval from the Newton Upper Falls Historic District Commission. Fiberglass is not an appropriate material; the adjacent doors are wood and the door that was removed was wood. The fiberglass door must be replaced with a wood door.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Paul Snyder, Acting Chair Laurie Malcom, Member Jeff Riklin, Member

Jay Walter, Member

72 Cottage Street – Certificate of Appropriateness

The Commission agreed to review the structural report, a minor change to the previously approved front dormer design, and the supplemental information to clarify outstanding questions from the previously approved application. Delince Louis, Aaron Breen and Dov Kirsztajn presented the information. The dormer was shifted over to comply with the City Zoning Ordinance which required a three-foot setback from the edge. D. Louis stated that the structural engineer confirmed that the structure had sustained water damage over a long period of time which would require extensive replacement of structural members; the existing framing was not historical. He confirmed that the following requirements that were identified in the approval to renovate the house and add dormers would be met: the corner boards were added to the plans, the windows would be two-over-two vertical grid Jeld-wen Tradition series with SDLs and spacer bars, and the opening and door on the front left side would be removed and filled with fieldstone.

Materials Reviewed:

Structural report
Plans
Elevations
Framing plans
Product specifications

Commission members commented that the dormer shift was appropriate; the asymmetry was consistent with the design that the Commission had previously approved. J. Riklin stated that building would need to be stripped down and reframed. J. Riklin also noted that the corner boards should be five-quarter by six. P. Snyder noted that these were not significant changes. J. Riklin motioned to accept the following: 1) the front foundation elevation basement entrance would be removed and in-filled with fieldstone to match the existing; 2) the windows would be Jeld-Wen Tradition Plus series clad with two-over-two vertical layout with simulated divided-lights and black spacer bars; 3) the front dormers would be as submitted and not be stacked, conforming to the Zoning Ordinance; 4) the corner boards would be five-quarter by six; and 5) the engineer's report. J. Walter seconded the motion. This motion was passed unanimously.

RECORD OF ACTION:

DATE: November 13, 2014

SUBJECT: 72 Cottage Street - Certificate of Appropriateness

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on November 13, 2014 the Newton Upper Falls Historic District Commission, by vote of 4-0:

RESOLVED to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness to accept the following for the previously approved project at 72 Cottage Street: 1) the front foundation elevation basement entrance will be removed and in-filled with



fieldstone to match the existing; 2) the windows will be Jeld-Wen Tradition Plus series clad with two-over-two vertical layout with simulated divided-lights and black spacer bars; 3) the front dormers will be as submitted and not be stacked, conforming to the Zoning Ordinance; 4) the corner boards will be five-quarter by six; and 5) the engineer's report.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Paul Snyder, Acting Chair Laurie Malcom, Member Jeff Riklin, Member

Jay Walter, Member

<u>991-997 Chestnut Street – Certificate of Appropriateness</u>

The Commission agreed to review an application to install front stair railings ex post facto. Bob Kelly presented the application and photographs of the installed railing system. He noted that there was a safety issue that required the existing railings to be replaced.

Materials Reviewed:

Photographs

J. Riklin stated that the new railing was pressure treated wood and was not appropriate. He commented that simple newel posts with fir two-by-two square balusters and fir handrails with a rounded edge would be appropriate. J. Walter recommended that the railing be installed inside the wing walls. The Commission members proposed that the contractor review preliminary designs with B. Kurze and J. Riklin before submitting a new application for a replacement railing system.

Administrative Discussion:

a) Approval of Minutes

The Commission approved the October 2014 minutes.

The meeting was adjourned at 9:00 p.m.

Recorded by Barbara Kurze, Senior Preservation Planner